



Individualland

Creating space for the individual

**Electronic
Media Analysis
from a
Consumers'
Perspective**

Supported by

Friedrich Naumann
STIFTUNG **FÜR DIE FREIHEIT**

**Electronic Media Analysis
from a
Consumers' Perspective**

Lead Author: Gulmina Bilal Ahmad

Researchers: Zulfiqar Haider, Khurram Saleem, Yahya Ahmad and Farhan Khan Khalid

The author acknowledges the support of Mr. Saghir Naqash (Deputy Director, Media & Projects, Press Council of Pakistan) for his editorial support and Friedrich-Naumann-Stiftung für die Freiheit for providing financial assistance to conduct this research. The information presented here would not have been possible without inputs from various sections of civil society. Despite all the assistance received, the lead author personally assumes the responsibility of any omissions.

Individualland

Where the individual counts

House 12-B, Street 26,

F-8/1, Islamabad - Pakistan

Tel: +92-51 2 25 34 37, 2 25 34 38

E-mail: info@individualland.com

Url: www.individualland.com

Supported by:

Friedrich-Naumann-Stiftung für die Freiheit

P.O Box 1733,

Islamabad - Pakistan

Tel: +92-51-2 27 88 96, 2 82 08 96

Fax: +92-51-2 27 99 15

E-mail: pakistan@fnst.org

Url: www.southasia.fnst.org

ISBN: 978-969-9582-271

No of printed copies: 1,000

Islamabad, December 2013

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	1
Introduction	4
Situational Analysis	8
Dimensions and Limitations of the Study	13
Citizens' Concerns	14
Safeguarding Interests	14
Influence of the State	15
Coverage Priorities	16
In the Name of Entertainment	17
The Analysis	19
Marketing of Tragedy	21
Humanizing Politicians but Anchors?	23
Setting Aside Objectivity	26
Editorial Control or its Lack	29
Ticker Journalism and Sensationalism	29
Vested Interests	31
Conclusion	32
Annexure I: Issues under Discussion during the Monitoring Period	34
Annexure II: Talk Shows and Current Affairs Programs	35
1. Kal Tak	35
2. Frontline with Kamran Shahid	37
3. To the Point	38
4. Khari Baat Lucman Kay Sath	39
5. Crossfire	41
6. Nuqta-e Nazr	42
7. Capital Talk	43
8. Aaj Kamran Khan Kay Sath	45
9. Aapas Ki Baat	46

Executive Summary

“Just because your ratings are bigger doesn't mean you're better...in journalism there are a lot of considerations other than just money.”

Ted Turner, American media mogul.¹


The media in Pakistan, especially the electronic media, has witnessed a progress in leaps and bounds within the last decade, which has been unprecedented throughout more than sixty years history of the country. A plethora of satellite and terrestrial channels have opened and can be viewed on TV screens across the country, where once only the state run channel had the monopoly. This has opened new avenues for the media consumers to become informed and acquire multiple viewpoints on a particular subject. However, there are instances where media due to their affiliations, inclinations and interests adopt uniformity in reporting or even failing to report certain information or news. The media liberalization has been accompanied with the aspect of 24 hours news, live and instant coverage of developments, candid talk shows and entertainment for various niche sections, to mention a few. Simultaneously, the consumers have reservations regarding information overload race for better ratings, marketing of tragedy, breaking news phenomenon, primetime phenomenon and impact of live reporting. The electronic media is perceived to be operating under vested interests and various influences. In addition, there is a race for better Television Rating Points (TRPs) between channels and even within channels. From a positive aspect, it is evident that after a decade of experiencing the transformation of the electronic media, the media literacy among consumers has also gradually developed. This was apparent, when public uproar surfaced regarding a controversial celebrity hosting a religious program, during July 2012. The program was discontinued after this negative response.² Another instance was the boycott of Pakistani news channels in Baluchistan during 2012. The reason stated was that the media was not giving the province and the issues plaguing it sufficient coverage.³ Although this may be considered negative means to get a point across, yet the incident also highlighted the media literacy within the consumers.

2013 marked the year for elections in Pakistan. The transition from a democratically elected government to another elected government remained the highlight. Viewers, intellectuals, media and others critically analyzed the transition phase. Media became the centre of attention as it remained the main source of information regarding the candidates and polling results. The media in this regard was also presented with a challenge, as it had to report on elections maintaining impartiality and objectivity, while also assisting the citizens to reach an informed opinion through in-depth analysis. Apart from the election debates

¹Fennessy, S. 2011. Ted Turner. Atlanta Magazine. May 2011. Retrieved from: <http://www.tedturner.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/08/Atlanta-Magazine-Cover-Article-MAY-2011.pdf>.

²Columnpk.com. (2012). Social Media Power! Veena Malik removed from Hero TV's Astaghfar show. July 19, 2012. Retrieved on: December 11, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://www.columnpk.com/social-media-power-veena-malik-removed-from-hero-tvs-astaghfar-show/>.

³Baloch, B. (2013). Cable operators suspend Urdu news channels in Balochistan. Pakistan Press Foundation (PPF). February 02, 2012. Retrieved on: December 11, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://www.pakistanpressfoundation.org/front-page/48315/cable-operators-suspend-urdu-news-channels-in-balochistan/>.



and analysis, the media critics heavily debated on how the content was presented in the media. Were the consumers influenced by its analysis and what role did this factor play on the results of the election? There are varying views, but it is evident that political parties seem to realize the importance of this medium and worked towards marketing their viewpoints, through electronic media.


An effort has been made to analyze the content being aired on the electronic media, while the majority of the data has been acquired from three (03) leading news channels in Pakistan namely Dunya News, Express News and Geo News. Transmission of the selected TV channels was monitored for a period of 264 hours/eleven(11) days i.e. June 04 – June 08, 2012 and September 20 – September 25, 2013. In addition, further monitoring was conducted in various timeframes, mentioned throughout the document. Due to limitation of time and resources only selected programs and news segments were analyzed. We try to bring into limelight the following aspects from a consumer's point of view:

- Is there a factor of information vs. information overload within the electronic media?
- Why is there a race for Television Rating Points (TRPs)?
- Marketing of tragedy by the media
- The impact of breaking news
- The prime time phenomenon
- The factors surrounding live reporting

The aspects which were highlighted during our research have been discussed in detail in the following sections, including the onslaught of foreign content in the form of dramas and shows, increased trend of moral policing, lack of professionalism during reporting, labeling, angling of news and absence of objectivity.

According to Article 19 of the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan, “Every citizen shall have the right to freedom of speech and expression, and there shall be freedom of the press, subject to any reasonable restrictions imposed by law...”⁴ The media has been given the freedom of expression, under this article, but there has also been a frequent misuse. Freedom should be accompanied with responsibility, which is found to be lacking in various instances. The use of sarcasm, poetry, proverbs and songs is a common practice in the news bulletins and was present on the monitored channels. This is not limited to only human interest or entertainment reports, but is also witnessed in reports containing serious developments. It was further observed that apart from few exceptions on Geo News and Express News most of the times no parental guidance warnings have been shown during news reports, when images of violence were present in the content. There were instances where biased and opinionated reports were presented, which influenced the credibility of the news stories. There were further instances of news reports which violated the privacy of citizens, especially politicians and celebrities. Lack of editorial control was also witnessed in the news coverage, where it resulted in inaccurate news reporting as well as spelling and

⁴Pakistan constitutionlaw.com. Article: 19 Freedom of speech, etc. Retrieved on: December 11, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://pakistanconstitutionlaw.com/article-19-freedom-of-speech-etc/>.



grammatical mistakes. During the monitoring period, there was sensational presentation of news items in the news ticker, crawler or slider. Such information is mostly incomplete and is aimed at compelling the viewer to watch the bulletin.

In addition, the various talk shows and current affairs programs aired on the three channels were also monitored. Most of the programs were found to be unbalanced, anchors giving sarcastic remarks, asking leading questions and making leading statements. During our limited analysis of the content presented on entertainment channels, we observed that it is being gradually overwhelmed by foreign content including dramas, advertisements and movies. This has been criticized as well as welcomed by certain quarters, where some perceive it as an opportunity for improving the quality of entertainment. The various morning shows revolved mostly around themes based on weddings, supernatural incidents, exorcism, domestic violence and moral policing. The content of these shows is found to be scripted and dramatic situations are created depicted as reality.

The aim of our analysis is to promote the viewpoint and concerns of the consumers, regarding the electronic media .As we enter a new era in Pakistan, where democracy has taken roots, there is prevalence of a vibrant judiciary and presence of vibrant media. The media has to work towards aligning responsibility and objectivity, with their newly acquired freedom. This will also act as a catalyst in strengthening and promoting the democratic system, while introducing transparency and accountability. The dynamics of the sector have been changing at a considerable pace and the media needs to adapt to them. There is increasing consumer literacy and the role of the media in presenting accurate and timely information has become more important than ever before. We are not only looking towards a larger media presence, but also a media which is sensitive towards the demands of its consumers. The marked increase in blogs, especially those associated with the various news websites like The Express Tribune and Dawn blogs, have opened up space for citizens to immediately present their views on a particular incident or happening. Citizens even present their views on the higher judiciary (Supreme Court of Pakistan), which is considered one of the most sacred institutions in the country. For instance, the staff of the top court had to face an overwhelming amount of criticism by citizens, politicians and media persons alike, after allowing rights of exclusive coverage to a private news channel of the full court reference on December 11, 2013, the last working day of Chief Justice (retired) Iftikhar Muhammad Chaudary. As a result the new Chief Justice immediately took notice⁵ of the incident and ordered an inquiry into the matter.

⁵Terence J. Sigamony. New CJP orders full-court reference probe: The Nation. December 13, 2013. Accessed online from: . Date of access: December 20, 2013.

Introduction

“Television cultivates from infancy the very predispositions and preferences that used to be acquired from other primary sources ...”

George Gerbner and Larry Gross, Cultivation Theory.⁶

Elections 2013 have been a defining moment in the history of Pakistan. With the presence of approximately 83 operational satellite TV channels⁷ in the country, 2013 elections remained the most televised polls in the history of Pakistan. Although the extent of media's impact on the outcome of elections and political developments is surrounded by considerable debate, but overall the political sections realize the implications as they look towards acquiring public outreach through the media. Electronic media has become one of the prime sources of information and entertainment for the citizens within the last decade. This has led to significant changes in the format or layout of the various newspapers in Pakistan. Accepting the increasing role of electronic media in the country, one of the leading English language newspapers, Dawn, made changes in the layout and format of the newspaper. On December 17, 2013, Dawn came out as a modern looking newspaper. Explaining the reasons for this change, the editor of the newspaper explained that “This has partly been driven by the need...for the Pakistani print medium to adapt to the world of television channels and social media...The job of print now is to provide the second, more thoughtful draft of history after television, Twitter and text phone messages have provided the initial information. The need of the day for the print media is to also provide context and analysis, explain why it happened and what it means instead of simply what happened.”⁸ Anchorpersons of news channels and hosts of entertainment shows have become celebrities and the media is considered to hold considerable influence on public discourse.⁹ National Assembly resolution against media anchors during March, 2013, which started as one minister's protest, turned out to be a crescendo of complaints against electronic media anchorpersons.¹⁰ The resolution criticized anchorpersons for presenting unverified information on their channels, leading to defamation of parliamentarians. The resolution further demanded owners of media houses to take “necessary action” against the individuals involved in such activities.¹¹

⁶ Johnson-Cartee, K. S. 2005. News Narratives and News Framing: Constructing Political Reality. United States of America: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers Inc.


⁷ List of satellite TV channels. PEMRA. Accessed online from: http://www.pemra.gov.pk/pemra/images/docs/stv/list_of_licences_issued_stv1.pdf. Date of Access: August 15, 2012.

⁸ Note from the editor: Dawn. P. 3. December 17, 2013. Accessed online from: http://epaper.dawn.com/DetailNews.php?StoryText=17_12_2013_003_001. Date of access: December 20, 2013.

⁹ Akhtar, A. S. 2012. An elite like no other. Dawn. February 15, 2012. Retrieved from: <http://dawn.com/2013/02/15/an-elite-like-no-other/>.

¹⁰ Raja Asghar. NA wants erring TV anchors out: Dawn. March 7, 2013. Accessed online from: <http://www.dawn.com/news/790854/na-wants-erring-tv-anchors-out>. Date of access: December 20, 2013.

¹¹ Anis, M. 2013. NA unites against 'black sheep' among anchorpersons. The News International. March 07, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-21417-NA-unites-against-black-sheep-among-anchorpersons>.



It was the year 2002 that marked the beginning of a new era for the electronic media in the country. On one hand, this led to a process that resulted in the restoration of democracy, judiciary and ousting of a military dictator. On the other hand, the media was also exposed to various other pressures, vested interests and influences. These were highlighted when the 'Media Gate' scandal floated on the social and mainstream media. Although it was a scandal that could have defined an all new code of conduct for the media, but instead those who were involved were hired by other media channels, totally ignoring the concerns of consumers of media. One of the prime reasons why consumers of media don't have a voice in the mainstream media realm is because of the lack of media literacy and due to the fact that they are not considered consumers by the electronic media in the first place. So the so called consumers of media only remain as spectators of media. Why they are not considered consumers? Is the fact that citizens of Pakistan do not buy content from media channels directly? In other words, they do not pay for the content or subscribe to what they watch on their TVs. Most of the media channels have their arrangements with the cable TV network in residential areas across Pakistan, which has nothing to do with the consumers. The only option left with the consumers is to switch off the TV or change the channel, if they do not want to watch a particular program. The platforms available to the consumers are the social media, blogs and Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA). The regulatory authority has established Council of Complaints in the four provincial capitals and the federal capital. Each council has five members and one chairperson. The council has the duty to provide redress for complaints launched regarding the operations of electronic media.¹² The complaints can be launched online, through telephone and in written form with the authority. Citizens, who are considered media literate have written blogs and have voiced their concerns as comments on different blogs.¹³ As of now considerable debates have been generated over the conduct of the media and the predicaments faced by it. Still, the electronic media,¹² as a whole has its corporate interests often overlooking the concerns of its consumers.

Although there have been efforts by the media associations and organizations towards development and implementation of guidelines for media ethics and responsibility,¹⁴ but the consumers still have concerns regarding the level of responsibility shown by the media. So far, media literacy has been gradually evolving among the consumers and it has been acting as a catalyst for promoting responsibility within the media. The private media, after its advent was immediately considered as people's media, because of two obvious reasons. First, it did not provide selective coverage of events or happenings in Pakistan like the state media and secondly, it started criticizing the government, which was not being done by the state media. However, with the passage of time, media literate citizens of the country started criticizing the private media for being too corporate and for ignoring the norms of

¹²Pakistan Electronic Media and Regulatory Authority (PEMRA). Council of Complaints. Retrieved on: December 26, 2013. Retrieved from:

http://www.pemra.gov.pk/pemra/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=15&Itemid=20.

¹³Mazhar Abbas/CPJ Guest blogger. Can Pakistan's corrupt media be checked?: CPJ blog: Press Freedom, News and views: Committee to Protect Journalists (CPJ): Defending Journalists Worldwide. Accessed online from: <http://cpj.org/blog/2012/06/can-pakistans-corrupt-media-be-checked.php>. date of access: December 20, 2013.

¹⁴Dawn. Channels frame rules for terrorism coverage. Retrieved on: February 18, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://archives.dawn.com/archives/41935>.




the Pakistani society.

Although, as mentioned earlier, the citizens do not buy or subscribe anything directly from the TV channels, yet the electronic media relies heavily on their viewership and the resulting advertisements for sustenance. The citizens are actually consumers of Fast Moving Consumer Goods (FMCG), which are advertised on the media. However, a drop or increase in viewership means somewhat correlated fluctuation in these advertisements. Through their power of remote the citizens have become the media consumers. The electronic media analysis from a consumers' perspective aims at analyzing T.V. programs and their content being telecasted on three leading news/entertainment channels operating in the country, based on the recognized standards and ethics for journalism. An effort has been made to monitor and scrutinize three (03) leading news channels in Pakistan namely Dunya News, Express News and Geo News. Due to limitation of time and resources selected programs and news segments were encompassed, while other channels could not be analyzed due to similar restraints. Anomalies have been identified, analyzed and comments are generated by the researchers from the point of view of a consumer of media. There are certain questions that this publication attempts to focus upon such as:

- Is there an information overload, or are the consumers more informed?
- Why and what is the race for better ratings?
- Does our media market tragedy for its own benefit, related to profit making and larger viewership?
- What is the impact of the breaking news phenomenon, where rather than informing consumers they are led towards frustration and uncertainty?
- Is there an out of bounds primetime phenomenon in our media paradigm?
- How does live reporting impact the media and consumers?

The aspects which were highlighted during our research have been discussed in detail in the following sections, including the onslaught of foreign content in the form of dramas and shows, increased trend of moral policing, lack of professionalism during reporting, labeling and angling of news and absence of objectivity. It is important to describe here that this publication is not just highlighting negativities that are part of the electronic media industry, but also highlights the positive aspects. For instance, politicians, celebrities and other important personalities have been humanized through programs and talk shows, where one can now easily find their favorite political leader in a war of words with his/her nemesis on a talk show, or get an insight into their daily lives and even get to know their families and their personal preferences in diet. On the negative side, one finds new class of elite in the form of anchorpersons, who have become household names, perceived (or self perceived?) as an icon for everything right and resultantly have achieved a status of divinity. They are self-styled experts or pseudo-intellectuals of everything ranging from health to sports.

The sensational presentation of news and the common utilization of sarcasm, poetry, proverbs and songs have affected the quality of news content and its presentation. It is often noted that news of bomb blasts, accidents and mob violence etc. are repeated. These tactics instead of informing the consumers result in creating an ambiance of fear, which often proves to be detrimental. There is also a lack of editorial control, leading to mistakes



in content which was observed in the form of spelling errors by our researchers. It also has become evident that the entertainment sector within the media is being exposed to increasing foreign content including dramas, advertisements and movies. Some perceive it as an opportunity for improving the quality of entertainment. The media is further viewed as presenting stereotypical roles in the entertainment content. This is apparent, through the daily airing of Turkish and Indian soap operas, movies and game shows, on various channels.

Free, Independent and Responsible Media or FIRM is a term coined by Individualland as part of its work with the media, in learning from their experience and knowledge, while also conveying the concerns of consumers to them. When we talk about FIRM, the focus is not towards a greater number of publications, channels or media outlets, but the need for freedom and independence to be synonymous with responsibility. There has been a gradual increase in media literacy, evident in the instance where a religious program was discontinued after public reaction over a controversial celebrity hosting the show.¹⁵ This literacy among consumers is accompanied by demand for responsibility on the part of media. Keeping this in view, media houses and associations are now devising code of conduct.¹⁶ This publication is an attempt to gauge the progress of the media towards adherence to their responsibilities.

¹⁵Columnpk.com. (2012). Social Media Power! Veena Malik removed from Hero TV's Astaghfar show. July 19, 2012. Retrieved on: December 11, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://www.columnpk.com/social-media-power-veena-malik-removed-from-hero-tvs-astaghfar-show/>.

¹⁶Pakistan Broadcasters Association. 2010. Proposed Self-Regulated Code of Conduct. Retrieved on: April 04th, 2012. Retrieved from: <http://www.pba.org.pk/psr.asp>.

Situational Analysis

“The emergence of television as a prominent provider of information has fundamentally altered the organization and flow of public information in the modern society.”

J. P. Robinson & M. R. Levy.¹⁷

Pakistan's electronic media has grown tremendously in the past decade. Undoubtedly, contribution of the electronic media in keeping citizens informed is immense. Due to the alacrity and promptness of the electronic media, events, incidents and new happenings are reported within no time. It is yet to be determined that whether the citizens of Pakistan have become more informed, due to the greater presence of electronic media. Then there is also the aspect of media literacy or awareness within the consumers. Through this publication we will not only look into how these channels have contributed towards informing the public, but also highlight consumers' concerns regarding the content being aired. This section will try to draw a picture of the present state of electronic media within the country.


In Pakistan, media has been influenced by the state. Till 2002 electronic media was dominated by state owned TV channels and the print media was also subjected to pressures, especially during dictatorial regimes. In the early 2000's media evolved with the establishment of private television and radio channels. Simultaneously, a regulatory body for electronic media by the name of Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA) was established in the year 2000; through the formation of the Regulatory Authority for Media Broadcast Organizations. Some analysts believe that the liberalization of media in 2002 was the result of the growing influence of foreign TV channels in Pakistan.¹⁸ With the media evolution that took place especially within the electronic media, there also came the phenomena of live reporting, breaking news, live and uncensored talk shows that has now apparently transformed current affairs into entertainment. This also introduced the more scientific but controversial method of ratings under Peoples Meters, which is carried out by a single company in the entire country. Before the meters were the Gallup surveys from selected respondents. Although the media outlets and individuals associated with them claim that the entire programming is based on the ratings, but according to the disclosed figures by the raters very few people (highest being 25% among the urban affluent) are interested in news and current affairs.¹⁹ However, Mazhar Abbas, a senior journalist argues that “The People's meter system is a faulty one as there isn't even a single meter in Balochistan. Out of 675 meters, 365 alone are in Karachi.”²⁰

¹⁷Johnson-Cartee, K. S. 2005. News Narratives and News Framing: Constructing Political Reality. United States of America: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers Inc.

¹⁸Television in Pakistan: An overview. Retrieved on: September 25, 2012. Retrieved from: <http://www.pas.org.pk/television-in-pakistan-an-overview/>.

¹⁹Naqvi, A. 2013. TV and the Politician. Pique. March, 2013.

²⁰The Business of TV: 'are ratings really the best judge of what viewers want?': The Express Tribune. September 29, 2013. Accessed online from: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/611008/the-business-of-tv-are-ratings-really-the-best-judge-of-what-viewers-want/>. Date of access: December 20, 2013.



Diversity of views, choice in acquiring information and highlighting of various viewpoints is considered a major characteristic of media sector within a democratic system. Media cross-ownership not only applies to electronic, print and social media, but also encompasses other areas such as telecommunications with subject to technological advancements. For example in recent years Google, Microsoft and Yahoo are considered to be giving a stiff competition to their more traditional media rivals. Media pluralism is equated with diversity of ownership, while an increase in media conglomerates or media concentration within the hands of certain groups is considered as a detriment. Such cross-media ownership or even media concentration within a certain segment is kept highly checked, if not banned; throughout the world. In United States a series of overhauls and deregulations were initiated after the Telecommunications Act 1996. This led to consolidation by telecom companies and broadcasters into cable services. Electronic media groups previously restricted to a certain medium, could own both radio and TV stations. However, there is a cap to this on the basis of population and market size. For example, as per 2003 rules media groups could purchase TV stations up to 39 percent service area cap of the country's population. In United Kingdom, according to the Communications Act of 2003; there must be separate media companies for radio, TV and newspaper in an area, while no group owning more than 20% of national print media circulation may own more than 20% TV service.²¹

In Pakistan cross-media ownership was another aspect which came forward after the liberalization of electronic media. Media groups already with a presence in the print media came forward to establish their own channels. This was not limited to only one channel by a certain group but a number of channels catering to different target audiences. Initially there were restrictions on cross-media ownership in the PEMRA regulations, which were removed in 2004 in order to facilitate the formation of channels.²² A critique which follows this development is the monopoly achieved by certain groups in the media sector. There is also the case where due to vested interests in sister concerns, the media outlets support and compliment them. The example can be taken from the row between Jang/Geo Group and government over the shutdown of their sports and music channel. During the entire episode the sister concerns, including newspapers and news channels initiated a campaign and kept the issue in limelight, while blaming the government for victimizing the group. In addition, one can also find evident consequences on the print media, where the newspapers are filled with advertisements of programs of their sister news and entertainment channels. Similarly, the details of previous day programs also fill the front and back pages, while the print media promotes their channel through announcing that they were the first to break the news.

²¹Canadian Radio-television and Telecommunications Commission (CRTC). (2007). Media Ownership; Rules Regulations and Practices in Selected Countries and Their Potential Relevance to Canada. July, 2007. Retrieved on: December 12, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://www.crtc.gc.ca/eng/publications/reports/mcewen07.htm>.

²²Raza, S. 2004. Cross-media ownership: Changes in PEMRA rules okayed. April 18, 2004. Retrieved from: http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=story_18-4-2004_pg7_25.

جیوائف آئی آر 29

نیوز کے پروگرام جیوائف آئی آر میں اسی حوالے سے خصوصی رپورٹس آج بدھ کو پیش کی جائیں گی۔ رپورٹ کے مطابق شہر قائمہ میں پولیس اہلکاروں نے چوہدری شریف شہر میں کامیاب گرفتاری کر رکھا ہے جنہیں دھمکیاں دی جا رہی تھیں کہ رشوت نہ دی گئی تو زندگی اتیرن بنا دی جائیگی۔ سرگودھا سے رپورٹ کے مطابق انوار نے تادیب کی ایک واردات میں ایک پولیس اہلکار ملوث لگا جبکہ لاہور میں ایک پولیس اسٹیشن کے اہلکاروں پر الزام ہے کہ انہوں نے ایک بااثر شخص کے کہنے پر ایک شہری کو پولیس موہاں میں لے کر ایک چوہدری کے گھر گئے اور اسے تشدد کا نشانہ بنا دیا۔ جیوائف آئی آر شام ساڑھے سات بجے نشر کیا جائے گا۔ میزبان نسیم صدیقی تھیں۔

جیوائف آئی آر میں آج پولیس اہلکاروں کی

مجرمانہ سرگرمیوں کی رپورٹ پیش کی جائے گی
کراچی (جنگ نیوز) مجرموں کی بڑھتی سرگرمیوں کے ساتھ پولیس اہلکاروں کے جرائم کی وارداتوں میں سینہ سپور پر ملوث ہونے کے واقعات میں بھی اضافہ ہوا ہے۔ جیوائف آئی آر میں آج پولیس اہلکاروں کی مجرمانہ سرگرمیوں کی رپورٹ پیش کی جائے گی۔

باقی صفحہ 6 نمبر 29



وقت نیوز نے سب سے پہلے خبر دینے کا اعزاز برقرار رکھا


18 ویں ترمیم پر سپریم کورٹ کا فیصلہ قریباً 11 بجے دن سنا گیا

وقت نیوز نے گناہ گار سپریم کورٹ کی عدالت عظمیٰ کی حق کا اعلان قرار دیا۔

اسلام آباد (جنگ نیوز) سپریم کورٹ نے سب سے پہلے کسٹ کے حوالے لینے کے بارے میں فیصلہ دیا ہے۔ گورننگ کونسل نے ایک بار سپریم کورٹ کو حکم دیا کہ وہ کسٹ کے بارے میں فیصلہ دے۔ کسٹ نے 18 ویں دسمبر کو فیصلہ دیا کہ کسٹ کے بارے میں فیصلہ دینے کے بارے میں کسٹ کے حوالے لینے کے بارے میں فیصلہ دینا ہے۔ کسٹ نے 18 ویں دسمبر کو فیصلہ دیا کہ کسٹ کے بارے میں فیصلہ دینے کے بارے میں کسٹ کے حوالے لینے کے بارے میں فیصلہ دینا ہے۔

جے 34

کوئی کالعدم کردہ جس دن کی سرگرمیوں کی ترقی کے لیے فری کال کے بارے میں پارلیمان کو نظر جانے کا ہے۔ سپریم کورٹ صرف شہرہ نشین کی آئیے سے حوالہ دینے کے بارے میں اپنی عدالت کا فیصلہ دے گا۔ کسٹ نے 18 ویں دسمبر کو فیصلہ دیا کہ کسٹ کے بارے میں فیصلہ دینے کے بارے میں کسٹ کے حوالے لینے کے بارے میں فیصلہ دینا ہے۔ کسٹ نے 18 ویں دسمبر کو فیصلہ دیا کہ کسٹ کے بارے میں فیصلہ دینے کے بارے میں کسٹ کے حوالے لینے کے بارے میں فیصلہ دینا ہے۔



Despite the introduction of freedom and independence, senior journalists and media experts are of the view that this liberalization was accompanied with the challenge of increased security threat to journalists and media personnel. Journalists were told to conform to the government's point of view, and those who did not were harassed and often killed by state agencies.²³ In recent years due to the conflict plaguing Pakistan, especially in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Baluchistan and Tribal Areas; journalists present there face threat to not only their well being but also to the safety of their families and friends. Furthermore, the journalists receive little or no training regarding safety, risk analysis and assessment. They put their lives at risk for getting a story.²⁴ According to estimated figures only 4,000 media personnel have been trained by 18 media organizations.²⁵ According to the Press Freedom Index 2013 by Reporters Without Borders, Pakistan has been ranked at 159th position out of 179 countries in the list.²⁶ The liberalization of media was also catalyzed by the boom in national advertising revenue, especially of the fast moving consumer goods (FMCGs). However, the situation changed when the state of emergency was imposed in the country in November 2007. Following this, all the national and international media channels were silenced for the next 90 days. PEMRA drafted a code of conduct in June 2007 without consultation with media houses or Pakistan Federal Union of Journalists (PFUJ). Most of the blacked out TV channels signed the code in February 2008 and their transmissions were resumed.²⁷ However, according to the latest TV viewership statistics²⁸ by Gallup Pakistan, PTV Home (state owned) is still the most viewed channel in Pakistan with a 43.258% outreach, representing almost 53 million viewers. Surprisingly, the second in line is Star Plus (an Indian channel) with an outreach of 14.235%, representing almost 17 million people. The only private channel that comes in the top five is Geo News that comes at number five, with a 6.639% outreach, representing almost 8 million viewers. The reason why PTV is still at the top is that almost 81% of rural population living in 45,000 villages doesn't have access to cable TV networks.

²³Siraj, A. Syed (PhD). Critical analysis of press freedom in Pakistan: Global Media Journal, ISSN 2070-2469, Volume I, Issue II (Autumn 2008). Retrieved on: September 20, 2012. Retrieved from: [http://www.aiou.edu.pk/gmj/artical1\(b\).asp](http://www.aiou.edu.pk/gmj/artical1(b).asp).

²⁴Ahmad, G. B. (2012). Journalism in Conflict Areas of Pakistan. Islamabad: Individualland Pakistan.

²⁵Ahmad, G. B. (2013). News, news everywhere but... Daily Times. November 30, 2013. Retrieved on: December 12, 2013. Retrieved from: http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2013%5C11%5C30%5Cstory_30-11-2013_pg3_6.

²⁶Reporters Without Borders. 2013. Press Freedom Index 2013. Retrieved on: January 28, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://en.rsf.org/press-freedom-index-2013,1054.html>.

²⁷Television in Pakistan: An overview. Retrieved on: September 25, 2012. Retrieved from: <http://www.pas.org.pk/television-in-pakistan-an-overview/>.

²⁸Gallup Pakistan Media Cyberletter: Television audience measurement edition. Gallup Pakistan. October, 2012. P. 2. Accessed online from: <http://www.gallup.com.pk/News/cyberletter-updated1.pdf>. Date of access: December 20, 2013.



Dimensions and Limitations of the Study

According to the information available on Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority's (PEMRA) website, there are a total of 83 operational satellite TV channels in Pakistan.²⁹ Out of these, a total of three (03) leading TV news channels were selected for monitoring. Transmission of the selected TV channels was monitored for a period of 264 hours/eleven (11) days³⁰ by our researchers:

- Geo News
- Express News
- Dunya News

The following table shows the various programs that were monitored:

Television Channels	Programme		
Geo News	Aaj Kamran Khan Kay Sath	Apaas Ki Baat Najam Sethi Kay Sath	Capital Talk
Express News	Kal Tak	To the Point	Front Line with Kamran Shahid
Dunya News	Nuqta-e-Nazar	Crossfire	Khari Baat Lucman Kay Sath

The researchers selected programs or specific parts of different programs that were deviating from journalistic ethics and elements of newsworthiness. The researchers have not collected any quantifiable data based on any fixed scale, of whether how much time was allocated to a specific subject, or which political party was awarded more coverage in terms of frequency or time etc. Rather, the monitoring was conducted keeping in view our perspective as news consumers.

Certain codes and principles have been assigned as a standard, which have been utilized in our previous research for an independent, responsible media. The same have been set as a benchmark in this current study as well. These standards might appear as a cliché to some, but they are the fundamental principles for journalists and the media. The criteria and benchmarks which were utilized for conducting the previous print media analyses, also assisted in conducting this analysis. The monitored inaccuracies include violation of privacy, single or unknown sources, lack of professionalism, opinionated news stories and biased reporting. There are certain elements in a news report that makes it newsworthy, which define its possibility of being aired or published. These characteristics encompass timeliness, proximity, significance/importance, confrontation/conflict, prominence, human interest/humor.³¹

²⁹List of satellite TV channels.PEMRA.Accessed online from: . Date of Access: August 15, 2012.

³⁰June 04 – June 08, 2012 and September 20 – September 25, 2013.

³¹Eric K. Gormly, Victoria Carrol. Approaching the television news story: Writing and Producing Television News. Blackwell Publishing: Iowa, USA. 2004. pp. 70-71. Accessed Online from: http://books.google.com.pk/books?id=L0CNKZVRvCwC&pg=PA70&dq=elements+of+newsworthiness+writing+and+producing+television+news&hl=en&ei=0PLmTv6jOMjChAfakbD2Cg&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CCwQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q&f=false Date of Access: December 13, 2011.

Citizens' Concerns


The concerns of the citizens, regarding the information being presented on the electronic media requires to be highlighted as they are the ultimate consumers. The media should be accountable towards its consumers, while it remains free of prejudice, bigotry and bias. The media also has the responsibility to educate the citizens through their in depth reporting, assisting in development of informed opinions, rather than sensationalizing stories, inclining towards vested interests or spreading uncertainty all for the sake of better ratings. However, we cannot base our argument on ratings, or simply on the fact that the so called consumers of media are not happy with the various private TV channels operating in the country. As described earlier, the ratings system based on people's meters is not representative of the whole population and the consumers are not the real consumers because they don't buy anything from the private TV channels. The real consumers for the private TV channels operating in Pakistan are advertisers of the various FMCGs. They buy airtime from the channels to air their content and spend millions of rupees on their advertisements. So in reality, the citizens are consumers of FMCGs, who are in turn real consumers of the private media. The expatriate Pakistanis residing in different countries pay to watch Pakistani news channels and are perhaps the only citizen consumers representing Pakistan. However, it is clearly written in PEMRA regulations that the ultimate consumers of media are the citizens of Pakistan.³²

Safeguarding Interests

The commercial and political interests of media groups have seriously comprised journalistic standards and professional news reporting. This was highlighted during the "Media Gate" scandal in June 2012, where links between leading journalists and a business tycoon came into limelight.³³ News channels being part of the corporate media industry telecast anything that sells. For now the decision makers seem to be the content producers, channels and corporate entities. The mentioned media scandal was also triggered by an off-air version of the interview with the business tycoon. The version apparently portrayed that the interview was being conducted due to vested interests of the channel. The content being aired is based on what serves the interest of the channels and attracts advertisement, rather than informing or disseminating awareness among the consumer. Although advertisements are required for the sustenance of media, but corporate interests should not replace responsibility towards consumers. The inclusion of parodies and songs in news bulletins, cartoons, animations and a never ending string of breaking news clearly provide an idea that these channels telecast anything and everything that results in an increase in their ratings. However, these ratings are not representative of the whole population. It is a fact that peoples' meters are only provided to a limited number of consumers, not even in every major city of the country let alone the rural population that constitutes the major

³²Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA). (2011). Distribution Service Operations Regulations 2011. December 02, 2011. Retrieved on: December 26, 2013. Retrieved from: http://www.pemra.gov.pk/pemra/images/docs/regulations/Distribution_Service_Operations_Regulations_2011.pdf

³³Nazir, Z. 2012. I will go to court against Malik Riaz – MeharBukhari. Aaj News. June 15, 2012. <http://www.aaj.tv/2012/06/i-will-go-to-court-against-malik-riaz-mehar-bukhari/>.



chunk of our population. So if these ratings are not representatives of the whole population then does it mean that the media is ignoring most of its consumers?

So far there is only one company “Media Logic”, which handles media ratings and the calculations are based on the feedback from nine major cities of the country, from a pool of more than 4,000 individuals. This also makes evident the lack of representation and data from the rural areas. The ratings are also criticized by media outlets, as they consider them to be tampered and inaccurate. Due to the subsequent race for better Television Rating Points (TRPs), the media has been struggling to maintain its course regarding the responsibility towards the consumers. The lack of research and investigation behind important news often results in serious damage to the reputation of an individual or an organization. Some analysts believe that media, especially the electronic media has emerged as a powerful tool for charting public discourse wielding considerable influence on the public opinion thus evidently becoming elite by the sacrifice of “journalistic prowess”.³⁴ The news bulletin of Geo News on 04th June, 2012 contained the report on dual nationality case in the apex court, where two leading figures of the government and the opposition were named, which had been included in the case among others, even though the case was yet to be decided.

Influence of the State

The electronic media has often been blamed for manipulating the opinions of its consumers on instructions of perhaps a stronger stakeholder in the media industry i.e. the state. The government provides 33% of advertisement revenue to various media houses, which is also an effort to keep them dependent.³⁵ PEMRA ordinance of June 2007 is also considered as a tool for keeping the electronic media under control by the state. The regulatory body was placed under the Ministry of Information responsible for content restrictions under the pretext of sovereignty, integrity and security. In addition, the response of PEMRA to Turkish and other foreign content on media channels was more of a moral policeman telling channels not to telecast something that is against local values and religion. However, in an incident where there was a five hour standoff between police and lone gunman during August, 2013 in Islamabad; PEMRA failed to stop the live coverage of the episode. Despite the fact that Chairman PEMRA made direct calls to the TV channels, but the coverage could not be stopped.³⁶ In January 2013, National Assembly's Standing Committee on Information and Broadcasting recommended the government and PEMRA to control the airing of foreign programs and even advertisements showcasing foreign talent. In addition, it was recommended that the ten percent (10%) permitted proportion of foreign content in relation to local programs should be maintained, as the committee

³⁴Akhtar, A. S. 2012. An elite like no other. Dawn. February 15, 2012. Retrieved from: <http://dawn.com/2013/02/15/an-elite-like-no-other/>.

³⁵Abdul Siraj, Syed. Critical analysis of press freedom in Pakistan: Journal of media and communication studies. Department of Mass Communication: Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad. Vol. 1(3). September, 2009. Pp. 43-47.

³⁶Daily Times. (2013). SC seeks mechanism to control TV channels' transmission. August 24, 2013. Retrieved on: December 12, 2013. Retrieved from: http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2013%5C08%5C24%5Cstory_24-8-2013_pg1_6.



considered that the channels were not adhering to this rule.³⁷

PEMRA also cautioned TV and radio stations regarding Valentine's Day, stating that public complaints were pouring in regarding the coverage associated with the event. Although there is no way for verifying what, how many and from where these complaints were registered to PEMRA, but this can be considered positively that at least apparently the regulatory body is alive to some consumer complaints. A similar situation can be noticed in the case of the media, where a controversial actress was called in to host a religious program. The resulting public outcry over the program, forced the channel to drop the show apparently or was it a publicity stunt for Hero TV?

Coverage Priorities

It is true that the overall condition of the country remains volatile, but there are also positive stories which are required to be highlighted and can inspire citizens. During the compilation of this report, a string of bombings took place on November 21 – 22, 2012 in major cities of Pakistan. It was observed that the importance given to each of these incidents differed according to the area where it took place. One other observation regarding this incident and any other such incidents being reported was that the news channels failed to bring forward any human interest stories. For example in one of the bombings, citizens had taken the victims to the hospital by risking their own lives, but this was not highlighted. During the month of January 2013, we witnessed the events of tragic Quetta bombings, which took the lives of more than hundred innocent people. It was witnessed that while sufficient coverage was given to the incident and the resulting protest by the grieving community, but when a grieving mother of a victim died,³⁸ there was very little attention given to the story, because no one followed up on the story.

³⁷Dawn. 2013. NA body recommends ban on airing foreign TV content. January 03, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://dawn.com/2013/01/03/na-body-recommends-ban-on-airing-foreign-tv-content/>.

³⁸Geo News. 2013. Quetta Blast Victim's Mother Passes Away. Retrieved on: January 28, 2013. Retrieved from: <http://videos.geo.tv/VideoGallery.aspx?ID=9910>.

In the Name of Entertainment

It is our view that our media is still holding on to the portrayal of stereotypical roles of men and women in Pakistan. For instance, professions are associated with certain ethnic backgrounds such as, *Pathan* as a watchman or bus driver. A female nurse with a male doctor, poor woman working as maid and a feudal lord who harasses the daughter of his tenant etc. are other stereotypical roles, which have been ingrained into the minds of viewers/consumers of electronic media. As a result they reject all the alternatives, terming them as western values. One concern by certain commentators is that dramas, plays and films depict violence or violent behavior.

There are morning shows being telecasted on every news and entertainment channel, during the hours of 8 – 10 am. Women seem to be the target audience of these morning shows. The morning shows on our selected news channels during the monitoring period, include *Khabar Yeh Hai* on Dunya News and *Geo Shan Sai* on Geo News. The discussions on these programs revolve around the daily political or social developments and news, while also encompassing human interest stories. Apart from this, the entertainment channels also have their own morning shows, which are considered to be more popular and are hosted by popular entertainment figures. According to our observation the content of these morning shows revolve around themes which are replicated on all the channels. For example if one show initiates programs on weddings or “Shadi Week”, other channels anticipating high ratings also conform to the same theme. The themes mostly revolve around weddings and supernatural content.

Dramatic situations are created and the contents on these programs appear to be scripted, which was also admitted by a host, as her program on youth courting in public parks landed her into considerable controversy.³⁹ The same host had invited a person claiming to receive divine revelations, who was later arrested and he admitted that all his claims were false. This was also mentioned by Talat Hussain in his program “News Night with Talat” on Dawn News, aired on January 27th, 2012. As mentioned earlier, the content is mostly aimed at providing entertainment such as exorcism taking place live, conversations with entertainment figures and dance segments. There have been also instances where supernatural or unexplainable events have been shown happening within the studio. Such was witnessed during the airing on 1st March, 2012 of “Good Morning Pakistan” on ARY Digital, where during a discussion on supernatural beings, the lights went off and everyone was shown rushing from the set.

In continuation of the trend of moral policing by the electronic media, a program “Baat Say Baat” aired on Express News February 01st, 2013 showed the host raiding a suspected brothel along with the police. She interrogated the people present there and threatened “We have the police accompanying us and they will take you to the station, if you do not tell the truth.” This trend has not only remained limited to an individual level, but has also taken hold at an institutional level. Overall it is our perspective that religious policing or media

³⁹Rizvi, A. 2012. The daters were paid actors, claims Maya. Pakistan Today. February 28, 2012. Retrieved from: <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2012/02/28/news/national/the-daters-were-paid-actors-claims-maya/>.



restrictions are not the domain of the regulatory body or for that matter religious policing is also not the domain of the media. It is for the consumers to decide whether they want to watch foreign shows and dramas, or if they despise the content related to Valentine's Day. The consumers have the power of remote control and if the media wants to gain their attention, they will not only have to improve their content, but balance independence with responsibility.

This section will present the most common inaccuracies identified in the various programs and news monitored for a period of 120 hours/five (05) days⁴⁰ on Dunya News, Express News and Geo News. As previously mentioned, we are presenting this analysis from a consumer's perspective, while the researchers have based their analysis on the recognized standards and ethics for journalism, as discussed earlier. The analyses of the news presented in these bulletins have been based upon the standards of news reporting, elements of newsworthiness and most importantly the consumers' perspective. The format of the electronic media is different from the print, where the channels are in constant competition for reporting the news as early as possible, while the print media has more time.⁴¹ A limitation, which the researchers faced during the course of this analysis, was that the content on the selected channels is in Urdu, presenting a difficulty in accurately conveying the tone and wordings of the conveyed message. This has been addressed to a certain level by also accommodating the exact quotes in Urdu, along with the translations in English.

The Kohistan *Jirga* issue, Arsalan Iftikhar's case, dual nationality issue, Baluchistan situation and Karachi violence dominated the news during the active monitoring period. We would like to discuss in this section some general discrepancies found in news items. A TV news bulletin mostly contains news and current affairs reported in individual stories and presented by one or more anchorpersons. This also includes interviews, expert opinions and field reports. The news bulletin consists of a script, recorded or live reports and inserts or grabs (video clips) from the ground.⁴² On 24 hour news channels, there is a bulletin after every hour, the duration of which varies according to the program timetable. There is also a news update shared after half an hour.


As a general observation, the use of sarcasm, poetry, proverbs and songs is a common practice in the news bulletins and was present on the monitored channels. This is not limited to only human interest or entertainment reports, but is also witnessed in reports containing serious developments. According to the guidelines for news bulletins, which we came across during our research, "Never use music as background to a news bulletin. It is distracting and ruins any variations in pace within the bulletin."⁴³ This has not been adhered to in the news bulletins, especially containing a tragic incident, where dire melodies are played in the background and sometimes movie songs are played in the backdrop of serious political developments. In addition assistance of graphics and sound effects are taken, with constant repetition to highlight a certain point, again to the limit where it is ingrained in the viewer's mind. All these points have been highlighted in the following analysis. It was further observed that apart from few exceptions on Geo News and Express News most of the times no parental guidance warnings have been shown during news reports, when

⁴⁰June 04, 2012 – June 08, 2012 and September 20, 2013 – September 25, 2013.

⁴¹Individualland Pakistan. 2011. English Media Analysis from a Consumer's Perspective. October, 2011. Individualland Pakistan: Islamabad.

⁴²The News Manual.Chapter 49: Radio and television bulletins. Retrieved on: November 22, 2012.Retrieved from: http://www.thenewsmanual.net/Manuals%20Volume%202/volume2_49.htm.

⁴³Ibid.



images of violence were present in the content. The censorship of disturbing images observed during the monitoring period has been discussed in detail, later in this section.

It is also important to describe here that during the monitoring period, “Arslan Iftikhar's case”, “Kohistan *Jirga* issue” and “the dual nationality case” was being discussed in almost every other program on the selected channels. The details of these issues have been shared as following and a number of examples from the monitoring period contain references from these incidents and cases. The details of these have been shared in Annexure I.

As mentioned earlier, the various talk shows and current affairs programs aired on the three channels were monitored. All these programs are different in their presentation, as in some programs guests and subject experts are invited for analysis and discussion, while in others a single person associated with the program gives opinion. From Express News three programs were monitored during the allocated time period i.e. Kal Tak, To the Point and Frontline with Kamran Shahid. Similarly, a total of three programs were monitored on Dunya News, which included Khari Baat Lucman Kay Sath, Crossfire and Nuqta-e Nazr. On Geo News current affair programs of Capital Talk, Aaj Kamran Khan Kay Sath and Aapas Ki Baat were monitored. Due to the proximity of Arsalan Iftikhar's case, dual nationality case, Karachi violence and deteriorating security situation in Baluchistan, every political talk show monitored revolved around these topics. The details of the programs and the discussions encompassed have been shared in Annexure II.

The following page contains our research finding. These findings reflect our own opinion, based upon consumers' perspective and the reader is free to agree or disagree.

“...heavy exposure to the world of television cultivates exaggerated perceptions...as well as numerous other inaccurate beliefs...”
George Gerbner and Larry Gross, Cultivation Theory.⁴⁴

Based on our analysis, this aptly describes the Pakistani electronic media, where the content often displayed in the news is mostly put forward in a very irresponsible manner. During the monitoring period, we found several examples where disturbing content was displayed with unnecessary background music and through sarcasm the news channels displayed extreme levels of irresponsibility without even realizing the impact on the viewers and the media itself. Although this does not lead to violation of any official code, yet as discussed earlier the use of music within bulletins is discouraged professionally. In performing arts music plays an important role by enhancing the intensity of the image that needs to be projected, but in news it is emphasized that the focus should be on the content. The utilization of background music was also observed in many of the reports pertaining to political developments and dramatic music was added in reports which covered tragic incidents. This was observed in the report on dual nationality case and in a report regarding the grief of a family of kidnapped child, aired on June 05, 2012 Express News bulletin.

In the Geo news bulletin of June 04th, 2012 a report of a firing incident in Quetta was presented, where at the onset a dire melody was played with the visuals, which undermined the content of the report. On the same day an accident in Kahuta was discussed, which again contained a tragic background melody. A common observation concerning such reports is that the grief and anguish of the family and relatives of the victims is presented in a manner, where it can be termed as disturbing. This was not only observed in these reports but in numerous others during the monitoring period. In the bulletin of Express News on June 06th, 2012, the news of self-immolation by a person in Karachi was aired. The report contained the disturbing (blurred) image of the person engulfed in fire with the audio. In addition, it also contained his interview right after the fire was extinguished. It was evident through the footage that the person was in considerable pain and required immediate medical attention, rather the media personnel took it as an opportunity to record his statement, which only points to the insensitivity of the media.

The same use of background music and melodies was witnessed in the monitoring of Dunya News. While broadcasting the report of an accident in Kahuta on June 04th, 2012 the news channel adopted this practice. In addition, the disturbing images of the grieving family members were also presented in the report, while such images were also shown in a news report concerning the death of a rickshaw driver in Karachi violence. Here it is pertinent to note that in the case of every catastrophe or incident, the media films and airs the images of grieving relatives without permission. This was very much evident during the coverage of Air Blue and Bhoja Air tragedies. If an interview is conducted, it is understandable that the interviewee understands that it is going to be aired, but in case of showing grief-stricken families, the people being filmed are unaware. This, on the other hand, also causes distress among the viewers as well.

⁴⁴Johnson-Cartee, K. S. 2005. News Narratives and News Framing: Constructing Political Reality. United States of America: Rowman& Littlefield Publishers Inc.

There were also instances where during the coverage of a sensitive topic, such as a bomb blasts or terrorist attacks; continuous advertisements appeared on the television screen along with the images. There is a trend of marketing tragedy, transpiring from the desire for increased program ratings. An example of this can be taken from the program Capital Talk on March 04, 2013, where the topic under discussion was the bomb explosion at Abbas Town, Karachi on the previous day. Advertisements appeared during the program, while in the background images of destruction and carnage were being shown.



One positive aspect observed during the analysis was that in case of images showing injuries, either the video was blurred or converted to grayscale to minimize the gore. This was observed in the news report on Express News pertaining to a killing incident in Quetta on June 04, 2012. In contrast, on Dunya News a report concerning the same incident, displayed the images of splattered blood in the aftermath of the target killing. Another positive aspect observed was regarding a report over the Kohistan *Jirga* verdict on Geo News on the same date. The faces of men and women in the video were blurred for protecting their identities, although this was not observed on other channels.



Humanizing Politicians but Anchors?

Media played a profound role in the recent elections. The media had the responsibility to provide objective coverage of various issues and political developments during elections, so it could assist the consumers in forming an educated opinion. It is a continuous debate as to how and what extent the media can influence the outcome, but it is a fact that each party makes the effort to convey their message and improve their image through the media. The anchorpersons of various current affairs programs have become household names, which is synonymous to achieving a level of divinity. They are seen by the public as being the person who confronts the politicians, exposes their shortcomings and as an icon of all things sacred. This unfortunately is not the case, as we will be discussing. This also became evident during the infamous media gate scandal, which exposed the various unethical practices among the ranks of media personnel.⁴⁵

Javed Choudary in his program “KalTak” of June 04th, 2012 seemed to have prompted confrontation among the representatives of the various parties, by adding statements such as PML-N is involved (in Karachi violence) and was not preventing one participant from interrupting the other. On June 05th, 2012 the host took an anti-government stance and kept arguing with the minister. When the opposition party representative asked the minister to resign over non-performance of his duties, the anchorperson supported the suggestion by stating that “the point is valid”.

In the program aired on June 06th, 2012 which discussed the case of Arsalan Iftikhar, the anchorperson was unable to maintain a balanced approach, as he made sarcastic remarks, stating “How will justice be served when you will save your sons?”, referring to the cases on the then prime minister's sons and resultant tensions between the judiciary and government. He interrupted the representative of the ruling party, due to which she expressed her reservation stating that others were allowed to speak without any hindrance. The same issue was the subject in June 07th, 2012 program, where again the host asked leading questions from the government representative and other participants mostly criticizing the government, stating on the very first question that “it seems the government is benefitting from all this situation, so there is a feeling that the government might be behind this”. The overall program gave the impression of a drawing room conversation, rather than a political talk show.

In the program “Frontline with Kamran Shahid” aired on June 04th 2012 the host took a stance in favor of certain opinion in the dual nationality case. He kept interrupting the panelist/subject expert (retired judge) and gave leading statements on the opinions expressed by the mentioned panelist. For example when the subject expert gave his opinion that the courts cannot disqualify a member of parliament in the backdrop of dual nationality case, the anchorperson kept on insisting that as “the ruling of the speaker has no value”, so the court has the authority to disqualify parliament members. On the issue of power shortage the anchorperson made a sarcastic remark, terming it as an “unprecedented achievement of the government”. The host here took an anti-government

⁴⁵Naqvi, A. 2013.TV and the Politician.Pique. March, 2013..



stance and interrupted the government representative a number of times.


Throughout the program it has been observed that the host kept making leading statements and promoted confrontation between the government and opposition panelist. The confrontation was taken to a level, where the panelists stooped to personal remarks. At one instance the host addressed one of the panelists as “*yaar*” or friend, which is inappropriate while anchoring. In the June 05th 2012 program the host took a comparatively balanced position and accommodated the views of every panelist. In the program aired on June 06, 2012, the host interrupted the government representative on many occasions and gave sarcastic remarks to his statements, where at 08:28pm he stated, “You did not restore the judiciary, rather it was due to Mian Sahib's efforts.”

Shahzeb Khanzada in the program “To the Point” aired on June 07th, 2012 gave equal opportunity to every participant and at one instance also prevented a confrontation by requesting the ruling party representative not to deviate from the subject and create an issue of party politics. When there was an exchange of harsh words the host went on a break, but in the meantime both government and opposition representatives were able to use this opportunity to exchange personal remarks. Although in the latter half of the program on many occasions, he asked leading questions from the panelists such as, “Is the ruling political party playing a role in the conspiracy?” He took an anti-government stance and gave statements on the case of prime minister's sons. On June 08th, 2012 the same subject was under discussion and it was observed that the host adopted a balanced approach during the program.

In the program “Khari Baat Lucman Kay Sath” aired on June 04th, 2012 the host (Mubashir Lucman) kept interrupting the panelists during discussion, while they were presenting their opinion. On one instance he became irritated and referred to the panelist as “*bhai*” or brother, in annoyance at 20:06pst. The word may not be disrespectful but it was conveyed in a negative manner. The anchorperson also made a sarcastic remark by stating that “...you are charging more fees...”, after the panelist corrected him for introducing him as a barrister, while he was senior advocate of Supreme Court. The host was continuously engaged in satirical discussions with the participants. In addition, no representative from the major opposition party was present to state their opinion, as the dual nationality case also involved their members in the parliament. In a positive move the host prevented one of the panelists from disclosing personal family information of certain political figure, terming it as a violation of privacy.

In his program on June 05th, 2012 where violence in Karachi was under discussion; the host addressed one female discussant as “*bibi*” irritably. Again it is to be mentioned that while the word itself is not derogatory, but the tone used changed the semantics. He also argued with the ruling party representative and also issued a “challenge” to the mentioned participant. On June 06th and June 07th, 2012 while discussing Arsalan Iftikhar's case, the panel mostly consisted of journalists and the host took a balanced approach, while the discussants were given sufficient opportunity to express their views.

As mentioned earlier, the words of *bibi*, *yaar* and *bhai* may not be offensive, but the tone in which they were delivered was not suitable for the forum. This was again observed, in the program “Crossfire” aired on June 04th June, 2012. The anchorperson (Mehr Bukhari)




accused the politicians to be employing political gimmicks and deceiving the public. She mostly asked leading questions from the panelists in a satirical tone such as, “Why is the Punjab government implementing ad-hoc projects?” Sufficient time was given to the discussants for expressing their views and opinions. She addressed one of the panelists (also a member of parliament) as “*bibi*”, in an irritated tone at 22:24 PST. On June 05th, 2012 the program was based around political issues and various other crises facing Pakistan. The anchorperson was observed interjecting the discussants, adding statements and asking leading questions, such as “What was the motive behind harassing the Prime Minister?” Meanwhile, the participants were allocated sufficient time to give their views. The program aired on June 06th, 2012 was concerning the case of Arsalan Iftikhar, where the anchorperson was observed taking a balanced approach.

The show “Nuqta-e Nazr” hosted by Habib Akram with senior journalist and editor Mujib ur-Rehman Shami encompassed Arsalan Iftikhar's case and Baluchistan violence on June 06th and June 07th, 2012 respectively. The host handled the questions, while the analyst gave his views and opinions and occasionally live calls were also accommodated in the show. The program is based on the analysis of a single person, while there was no disclaimer observed specifying that the program consists of opinions of the individual. Otherwise no labeling or angling has been observed during the program.

In the program “On the Frontline with Kamran Shahid” aired on February 15th 2013, an argument erupted between two guests belonging to different political parties one from Peoples Party and the other from Minhajul-Quran. The argument developed into a heated discussion, leading to an exchange of harsh words and derogatory remarks between the guests. At this point complete lack of professionalism was shown on the part of the anchor and the channel. The responsibility of the anchor person is to moderate the show in a professional manner and if such a situation occurs, the host should take a break at that particular moment or censor the derogatory remarks used. It seems television channels and anchorpersons have forgotten the ethics of being a responsible media.

The program “Capital Talk” aired on June 04, 2012 had an overall balanced approach, as there was no angling or labeling witnessed. The anchorperson (Hamid Mir) on some occasions also asked leading questions such as, while taking the opinion of a member of the federal ruling party in Punjab he asked, “Why is the behavior of your government towards Punjab, like a stepmother?” On June 05, 2012 the host took over the issue of dual nationality parliamentarians and the problems facing the incumbent prime minister. On June 06, 2012, Arsalan Iftikhar's case came under discussion and again it was observed that on certain occasions the anchorperson made leading and sarcastic remarks such as, “Will the allegations be proven against Arslan Iftikhar or will this emerge as another conspiracy, which again failed?” Otherwise the program approached the matter with a balanced viewpoint and presented a legal perspective of the issue. Unlike the other previous programs, on June 07th, 2012 the compere from the onset gave leading statements, terming the issue as “conspiracy”.

The program “Aaj Kamran Khan Kay Sath” seems to circulate around the opinions and views of the host on the latest news and emerging developments. On June 04th, 2012 it was observed that only the opinion of opposition was taken on the issue of energy crisis and no



government representative was engaged. In the program aired on June 05, 2012 it was observed that the anchorperson's views dominated the program and he adopted sensationalism, by giving statements such as “Suicide took place in the home city of the Prime Minister”.


The program “Aapas Ki Baat” hosted by Muneeb Farooq and Najam Sethi is based on the commentary and views of a single person, where the host puts forward the questions and points for discussion. There is no angling or labeling in the show. It is to be noted that no source is mentioned while sharing this information, rather the source is referred to as “*chirya*” or bird. It is a positive aspect where a disclaimer is shown at the beginning, clarifying that the discussion in the program is based upon the personal opinion of the commentator and the host. Another positive observation was that the analyst refused to comment on Arsalan Iftikhar's case, due to lack of any evidence.

Setting Aside Objectivity

Media is a field which requires very high level of professionalism. Unfortunately, in last few years because of Television Rating Points (TRPs) which has transformed media into cutthroat business, the level of professionalism has declined immensely. Such inaccuracies also mislead the consumers and can result in building misconceptions about a particular event or incident. It is extremely important that a host/reporter should be completely unbiased while reporting a news story or anchoring a show. His/her own opinions should not be reflected in the story. Biased reporting can influence the authenticity of the news story. It is unethical and due to this, the scope of a news story can be changed. Opinionated reporting can potentially create hatred against a specific group and occasionally also results in promotion of a certain agenda.

Since the evolution of media in the last decade shows of various natures are gaining popularity as well. Apart from dramas, entertainment, religious shows are gaining mass popularity among the consumers. In order to increase the TRPs of channels media groups are introducing various topics which are able to retain the attention of its viewers. Religion already remains a highly controversial subject among the populace of Pakistan. The commercialization of religion is being done in order to increase the ratings and viewership of the media channels. In the month of Holy Ramadan religious programs were telecasted live on different television channels like Shan e Ramadan on Ary Digital hosted by Waseem Badami and Junaid Jamshed and Amaan Ramazan hosted by Dr. Aamer Liaquat on Geo TV. These shows were telecasted during the time of *Sehr* from 1:30 am till dawn and in the afternoon from 3pm onwards to *Iftar* (sunset). The issue is not to criticise the production of such shows but the fact that when such shows are being produced objectivity should be kept in mind rather TRPs and viewership.

A pertinent example of lack of objectivity and show of highly unprofessional attitude by the host is of Amaan Ramazan. On 25th July 2013 the host Dr. Aamer Liaquat invited singer Tahir Shah who rose to fame with his song “Eye to Eye” The singer first had to bear personal attacks by the host about his hair which is highly unprofessional and again it was not a



stand-up comedy show, rather it was a religious show which promotes moral and ethical values. Later the host interrupted the singer by bringing a snake into the studio and wrapped it around the singer's neck, scaring and making him feel awkward. Other than religious shows Maya Khan's Morning Show on Express News is a show to be discussed. In one of the episodes the host created a farce by making the guests believe that a supernatural being *jinn* was present in their body and so called experts on the show had the power to extract them. In the show the guest started to behave awkwardly, lying on the floor and then jumping from one place to another with his eyes closed.


Making complete fool of the studio audience as well as the viewers by manipulating the psyche of the naive and ignorant people the show promoted that such beings do exist. This means for instance when a woman is drugged or behaves abnormally in a rural area people will believe that there is some supernatural spirit involved. Rather than providing her with the needed psychiatric care they will take her to someone who will try to exorcise the evil spirits.

Let us now discuss a news story regarding biased and opinionated reporting on the electronic media. On June 05th, 2012 the Geo News bulletin had the news of the former interior minister being posted as an advisor, due to the dual nationality issue. The news report was opinionated and more of a commentary rather than reporting the actual development. It stated that whatever may come the individual will remain a part of the cabinet. Similarly, the very next day on Jun 06th, 2012 in the report concerning the strike by CNG associations, the reporter appeared to be opinionated as the report was presented in a manner where the commentary was aimed against the CNG association. The reporter only gave one side of the picture while completely ignoring the other side. This showed the reporter being biased on this issue instead of finding out the reason of the strike by CNG association. A reporter has to be impartial while reporting; he cannot side with one party.

In the dual nationality case, it was observed that the names of leading politicians accused of dual nationality were presented in a report again on the Express News on June 05th, 2012. It was observed that the tone of the report suggested, as if the charges had been proven.

Articles 14 and 15 of the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan describe the precincts of private and personal lives of citizens of the country. There has been an ongoing process of debate over ways to reconcile freedom of expression by the media and privacy of a citizen. This is essential in a free and democratic society but with respect for the private lives of individuals. Privacy aids individuals to preserve their sovereignty and individuality.⁴⁶ Similarly PEMRA Code of Conduct Schedule-A rules 2(l)(f) and 15(1) also discuss in detail the related limitations on the media stating, "No programme shall be aired which- (d) contains anything defamatory or knowingly false;(h) maligns or slanders any individual in person or certain groups, segments of social, public and moral life of the country."⁴⁷ Unfortunately, throughout our research we have witnessed that Pakistani news channels on frequent basis have violated the privacy of individuals. Violation of privacy can not only cause a serious setback for the person, but also contributes towards his/her defamation.

⁴⁶House of Commons. 2004. Privacy and media intrusion: Replies to the Committee's Fifth Report, 2002–03. February 09, 2004. London: The Stationery Office Limited. Retrieved from: <http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm200304/cmselect/cmcomeds/213/213.pdf>.



There have been many news reports in which privacy of citizens have been violated. Let us now discuss a few examples regarding this. One example is of Maya Khan's Morning show on Samaa TV Subah Saveray Maya Ke Saath in which the host with her team raided public parks of Karachi to catch couples who were reportedly dating in public parks. The show aired on Jan 17 2012 on Samaa TV was a complete violation of privacy of citizens, complete lack of professionalism shown on the part of the host as well as the channel, just to increase viewership and have an edge over other channels on having higher ratings. The media is there to report incidents not to interfere in citizens personal lives by violating their privacy just to create an interest for the consumer. The response on this program by the consumers was very negative and the host had to face a lot of criticism on this irresponsible and unprofessional attitude pressurizing her to come on television and apologize to the public. It also resulted in Maya being fired from the channel. However, now she has been rehired by another TV channel.

⁴⁷Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA). Code of Conduct. Retrieved on: December 12, 2013. Retrieved from: http://www.pemra.gov.pk/pemra/images/docs/legislation/Code_of_Conduct.pdf.
http://www.pemra.gov.pk/pemra/images/docs/legislation/Code_of_Conduct.pdf.



Editorial Control or its Lack

Live programs and real time news coverage have brought along with them a predicament for editorial oversight. It has become very difficult to control the mistakes being made by reporters, newscasters and anchorpersons as the programs are being televised live. Resultantly, there are inaccurate news reporting and minor mistakes in spellings and grammar. This lack of editorial control was evident during our observation of the mentioned TV news channels.

For instance, in a news report aired on June 05th, 2012 on Dunya News concerning a family feud, where two persons subjected their step-mother to violence, over financial issues; the backdrop displayed the word torture. Whereas according to United Nations Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment and Punishment (CAT), torture has been defined as “any act by which severe pain or suffering, whether physical or mental, is intentionally inflicted on a person...with the consent or acquiescence of a public official or other person acting in an official capacity.”⁴⁸ There has been no public official involved in this incident, so it should be categorized as violence not torture. This mistake was again made in the very next news report, again containing an incident of violence. This highlights the lack of in-depth knowledge regarding issues by not only the reporter, but all the staff concerned with the development and airing of news report.

There is an instance where a grammatical or spelling mistake in the headlines was also noticed, in the Express News bulletin on June 06th, 2012. The headlines were supposed to be “Hearing of two significant cases in the Supreme Court today”. Instead the Urdu word “*ehum*” or important was displayed as “*hum*”, meaning we.

In another news report on June 04, 2012 Express News, regarding a firing incident between police and criminals, the picture of Pakistan's ambassador to United States was displayed out of context and was later removed.

Ticker Journalism and Sensationalism

One other observation during the monitoring phase was the sensational presentation of news items in the news ticker, crawler or slider at the bottom of the screen. The information is mostly incomplete and is aimed at compelling the viewer to watch the bulletin. For instance on June 04th, 2012 Geo News, a ticker contained “*Malik sahib manjhdar mein*” meaning “Malik in a fix”; with reference to the dual nationality case involving the interior minister. Similarly another crawler read referring to a speech of the prime minister “*Apni hadood mein rahain...Wazir-e Azam nay keh dia*” or “Stay within limits...states Prime Minister”, which were not his exact words or even if they were they are completely blown out of context. Besides narrating the whole context media tends to pick such statements or words in order to create sensation. It is to be noted that although the ticker conveyed the


⁴⁸Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. Retrieved on: December 31, 2012. Retrieved from: <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/cat.htm>. http://www.pemra.gov.pk/pemra/images/docs/legislation/C ode_of_Conduct.pdf.

message as if the prime minister had delivered it in a stern tone, but the actual content of the speech was not such. The actual statement as conveyed through the bulletin was that “Parliament, executive and judiciary have their defined authority and they have to work within these confines.”

It was mentioned earlier that there is a common practice of using proverbs and poetry in headlines and news reports. This was observed in a news report on Express News June 05th, 2012 concerning General (Retd) Pervez Musharraf and Benazir Bhutto assassination case. The headlines read “*Badalta hai rang asman kaisay kaisay*” meaning the changing situation. The ticker concerning the forthcoming news bulletin on Dunya News for 04th June, 2012 also had a sarcastic tone to it, where it displayed statements, “*Dohri shehriat walon ki khair nahin...*” meaning “Dual nationality holders will not be spared...” and “*Rehman ko takheer lay baithi*” meaning “Delay caused problems for Rehman”, both referring to dual nationality case.

Media personnel have adopted a habit of repeating a sentence or phrase multiple times to create sensationalism, which most of the times also highlights the lack of content available to the presenter or reporter. A pertinent example of constant repetition of news was observed regarding “breaking news”, presented in the bulletin of Dunya News on 07th June, 2012. The news was concerning the investigation of a murdered Deputy Superintendent Police. The anchorperson stated again and again, “The DSP was murdered by his servants.” This came forward during investigation into the murder by the police. This sentence was repeated at least nine times during the span of roughly three minutes, while there was also repetition in other details related to the crime.





Speaking of creating sensationalism by the media, one example worth mentioning over here is of August 15th 2013 when a man accompanied by his wife and two children took the entire city of Islamabad hostage for about five hours. The media gave live coverage of this. Due to this live transmission the police seemed to be reluctant to take some action against the armed man, which could have created chaos and the police would have had to face severe criticism by the media. Showing unprofessional attitude the media even started playing a role of a mediator between the attacker and the government in order to diffuse the situation. This was shown in KalTak, a talk show on Express News hosted by JavedChaudary, who took the call of the attacker's wife and tried to play a role of a mediator by passing her demands to the government. This was later condemned by a guest on the same show, who even when on to say to the host, "you shouldn't have taken the call of the gunman's wife." The media just to create sensationalism and an increase in viewership constantly repeats one news and incident over and over again. The media's responsibility is to report an incident, not to pass judgments or give advice on how the situation should be handled.

Vested Interests

Besides the vested interests of individual media personnel, the corporate and vested interests of media groups has also attained limelight. There has been the general perception of media alignment with certain corporate entities and affiliations or hostilities towards certain political sections. Media Gate scandal has to be referred to, if we want to understand the extent of it.⁴⁹ With reference to vested interest, it was observed during the monitoring period that as the Geo news channel is part of a group which also has an entertainment channel, the news of programs from the entertainment channel were also included in the main bulletin. The example can be taken from the news bulletin of June 05th, 2012 where a report of a drama serial was included within the first 14 minutes of the 9:00 pm bulletin, although the bulletin does have a separate entertainment section.

⁴⁹Naqvi, A. 2013.TV and the Politician.Pique. March, 2013.

Conclusion


This analysis along with other analyses of this series has been conducted from a consumer's point of view. Therefore a consumer remains at the center stage of this analysis. It might be too arrogant to declare that this publication or other publications of this series presents the consumers' point of view in its entirety. An important reason for this declaration is the ever changing or evolving media landscape of Pakistan. This analysis has attempted to point out that the electronic media since its liberalization has been evolving at a constant pace. Similarly, the viewers or consumers of media have also been made a part of this evolution. Therefore, it is too early to reach a definite conclusion about the consumer's perspective. Additionally, preferences, religious affiliations, local culture and most importantly media literacy remain key factors shaping the consumer's perspective.

With the greater outreach of the electronic media in recent years, it is available to population in both rural and urban areas. Advertisement remains the driving force and while it provides sustenance to the media, due to growing commercial interests of media groups it is also being viewed as a hurdle. The media, instead of emphasizing responsibility and objectivity is engaged in a competition of acquiring viewership and better ratings.

Most of the programs and news bulletins monitored were not objective or balanced. There was violation of privacy, non-professional approach, angling and labeling evident, as analyzed by the researchers. However, the inputs and comments by the participants and panelists of the programs have not been analyzed, because they reserve the right to present their own points of view. Since, most of the shows were based on political discussion that is why the participants were biased towards their own parties and ideologies. However, the hosts on these shows were mostly witnessed taking sides in a discussion and aligning themselves towards one viewpoint or another. The anchorpersons also gave sarcastic remarks and statements that promoted confrontation among the participants. Leading remarks and questions were particularly noted in certain current affairs shows, while analysts in these shows also were found disclosing information without presenting any concrete source.

Further, it was also observed that while reporting, the news each channel had a different priority for each news item. While a certain news report was presented at the beginning of the bulletin by one channel, the same information was presented at the conclusion by the other. There was also a different way to present the report on each channel, which contributed to it being balanced or opinionated. The sensational presentation of news and the common utilization of sarcasm, poetry, proverbs and songs effected the quality of news content and its presentation. There is also a lack of editorial control, leading to mistakes in content which was observed in the form of spelling errors by our researchers. The media personnel lack in-depth knowledge regarding certain issues, which result in inaccurate presentation of the news observed in the form of categorizing incidents of violence as torture. Further, certain news reports were also observed to be in violation of privacy of individuals.

One positive aspect, which came forward during the monitoring period was that in most



images showing injuries, either the video was blurred or converted to grayscale to minimize the gore. In certain situations, some of the channels refrained from disclosing the identity of victims; where it could lead to further compromising their security. This was evident in the initial coverage of the Kohistan *Jirga* issue, where the faces of the men and women were blurred in the news reports.

For the sake of TRPs and increased viewership religion and superstition etc are being used. The media is further viewed as to presenting stereotypical roles in the entertainment content. Further, in various morning shows it was observed that the content revolved mostly around themes such as weddings, supernatural incidents, exorcism, domestic violence and moral policing. Every channel adopted the same themes in similar time periods to generate viewership. The content of these shows, as was also highlighted during a controversy over moral policing; is scripted and dramatic situations are created.

As we gaze towards the future of the electronic media in Pakistan, we are not only looking at greater numbers of news and entertainment channels, but also at higher quality of content and information for the consumers. Although now there is a realization by the media associations and media houses regarding their responsibility towards consumers, as they devise code of conducts; still a lot of effort is required for implementing and perhaps even reviewing these codes to attain the desired balance of media freedom and responsibility.

Annexure I:

Issues under Discussion during the Monitoring Period

The details of issues under discussion, during the timeframe of the monitoring are as under:

Issues	Details
Arslan Iftikhar's case	A prominent real estate business tycoon alleged the chief justice's son of taking payments from him, on the basis of expediting the court cases. The issue was highlighted on the social media, after which the chief justice took suomotu action.
Kohistan <i>Jirga</i> issue	<i>A Jirga</i> in Kohistan issued death penalty to four women and two men for dancing at a wedding, after the video was uploaded on YouTube. The apex court took suomotu notice of the issue, after media reports.
The dual nationality case	A constitutional and legal bar on dual nationals to become parliamentarians was highlighted, after court cases pertaining to many members of parliament in relation to this legal issue, came forward.

Annexure II:

Talk Shows and Current Affairs Programs

1. KalTak

KalTak by Javed Choudary is a political talk show in which various topics are discussed.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 04, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Dual nationality case, Karachi target killings and protest in	<p>The program revolved around the suspension of interior minister from the National Assembly and Senate due to dual nationality. In the latter half, target killing in Karachi and the protest of PML-N in the national assembly was discussed.</p> <p>Participants: Aasma Arbab Alamgir PPP Khurram Dastagir PML-N Abdul Rasheed Gudail MQM</p>

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 05, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Load Shedding and Shahbaz Sharif's tent office and dual nationality the	<p>The program was focused on the Prime Minister, drone attacks, NATO supply route and Shahbaz Sharif's tent office. It also discussed the load shedding issue within the country.</p> <p>Participants: Pervaiz Rashid PML-N Tasneem Ahmed Qureshi PPP Sardar Bahadur Ahmed Khan PML-Q</p>

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 06, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Arsalan Iftikhar's case	<p>Chief Justice's suomotu action against his son being dubbed as a historic decision...What is more to come?</p> <p>Participants: Sardar Ishaq Lawyer of Dr. Arsalan Mehreen Anwar Raja PPP Muhammad Hanif Abbasi PML-N Umer Cheema</p>

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 07, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Arsalan Iftikhar's case	<p>The discussion revolved around Arsalan Iftikhar's case and the ethical stand of the chief justice.</p> <p>Participants: Ansar Abbasi Analyst Hamid Khan Advocate PTI Imtiaz Safdar Warraich PPP Senator Tariq Azeem</p>

2. Frontline with Kamran Shahid

This show is hosted by Kamran Shahid. This talk show often uses a short documentary to build upon the topic selected for discussion.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 04, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Dual nationality case and Load shedding.	Dual nationality and parliamentarians, strike due to load shedding in Faisalabad. Participants: Shaukat Mehmood Basra PPP Abid Sher Ali PML-N Andleeb Abbas PTI Justice (R) Fakharud-Din G. Ibrahim, Senior Advocate Supreme Court

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 05, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Kohistan case	Islamic point of view on Jirga, women rights and their denial. Participants: Sharmila Farooqi PPP Justice [®] Nasira Iqbal Former Chief Justice of Lahore High Court Mufti Naeem Head of Jamia Binoria Orya Maqbool Jan Columnist

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 06, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Arsalan Iftikhar's case, dual nationality parliament members and security threats to Asma Jahangir	Chief Justice's son, Arsalan Iftikhar is once again surrounded by allegations. Who is threatening Asma Jahangir? Participants: Sardar Ishaq Lawyer of Dr. Arsalan Asma Jahangir Former President Supreme Court Bar Association Siddiq-ul-Farooq PML-N Shaukat Mehmood Basra PPP

3. To the Point

This show is hosted by Shahzeb Khanzada and also involves discussion on latest political developments.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 07, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Arsalan Iftikhar's case	How long will the case of Arsalan Iftikhar linger? Participants: Abid Sher Ali PML-N Kashmala Tariq PML-HK Shaukat Mehmood Basra PPP Babar Sattar Advocate High Court

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 08, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Arsalan Iftikhar's case	Malik Riaz is playing a dual role. He claims to trust the court but is he trying to implicate chief justice's son? Who made the videos of Arsalan during his visit abroad? Participants: Senator Mushahid Ullah Khan PML-N Ansar Abbasi Analyst Shafqat Mahmood PTI Imtiaz Safdar Warraich PPP

4. Khari Baat Lucman Kay Sath

Khari Baat Lucman Kay Sath was a political talk show hosted by Mubashir Lucman. Arsalan Iftikhar's case and the Dual Nationality case remained in the lime light during the whole week.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 04, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Rehman Malik's suspension, what next?	The show revolved around the dual nationality case. Participants: Raza Hayat Hiraj PML-Q Akram Sheikh Law Expert Inamullah Khan Niazi PTI Naveed Chaudhry PPP

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 05, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	A peaceful Karachi remains a farfetched dream	Violence in Karachi and the role of political parties. Participants: Sharmila Farooqi PPP Shahi Syed ANP Irfan Siddiqui Analyst

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 05, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Arsalan Iftikhar's case	The country is engulfed in scandals. Participants: Dr. Shahid Masood Analyst Javed Chaudhry Analyst/Anchorperson Express News Haroonur-Rasheed Analyst Ahmed Awais Advocate LHC

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 05, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Arsalan Iftikhar's case	Arsalan Iftikhar's case: Country surrounded by allegations. Participants: Kamran Khan Analyst/Anchor Geo News Shaheen Sehbai Dr. Shahid Masood Analyst Justice (R) Nasira Iqbal Former Chief Justice of Lahore High Court

5. Crossfire

Mehr Bukhari hosted the political talk show known as Crossfire. During the monitoring period, the show focused on various topics such as Baluchistan issue, railways, load shedding issue and Arsalan Iftikhar's case.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 04, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Upcoming elections, Baluchistan issue and protocol of former prime minister	<p>Billions spent on laptops and cheap bread, why not on electricity? Nawaz Sharif's protocol, elections and missing persons' case.</p> <p>Participants: Marvi Memon PML-N Senator Mir Hasil Bizenjo NP Andleeb Abbas PTI Dr. Nafisa Shah PPP</p>

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 05, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	Politicians and their ill planning, while the nation is engulfed in crisis	<p>Railways issue, drone attacks and development funds in the hands of politicians.</p> <p>Participants: Dr. Samar Mubarak Mand Member Science & Technology Khurram Dastagir Khan PML-N Aasma Arbab Alamgir PPP Dr. Farrukh Saleem Analyst</p>

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 06, 2012	Reactive	Balanced	Arsalan Iftikhar's case right or wrong	<p>Is the allegation on Arsalan Iftikhar, correct or not? Justice must be done and people should witness it.</p> <p>Participants: Dr. Khalid Ranjha Advocate Supreme Court Athar Minallah Advocate Supreme Court Yasin Azad President Supreme Court Bar Association Jamshaid Ahmad Khan Dasti PPP</p>

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 07, 2012	Reactive	Balanced	Imran Khan's exclusive interview	Imran Khan's private life in an interview.

6. Nuqta-e Nazr

Nuqta-e Nazr is a show in which HabibAkram hosts the show, while senior journalist and editor Mujibur-RehmanShami presents his analysis on various issues. During the monitoring period, this show also focused on ArsalanIftikhar's case and its implications.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 06, 2012	Reactive	Balanced	Arsalan Iftikhar case	<p>Will Justice be Done?</p> <p>Participants: Habib Akram Mujeebur Rehman Shami</p>

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 07, 2012	Reactive	Balance	Arsalan Iftikhar's case and Baluchistan violence	<p>Violence in Baluchistan was also discussed. Arsalan Iftikhar's case, an allegation or reality?</p> <p>Participants:</p> <p>Habib Akram</p> <p>Mujibur-Rehman Shami</p> <p>Rauf Klasra Analyst</p>

7. Capital Talk

Capital Talk is a famous political talk show hosted by Mr. Hamid Mir. During the monitoring period, the show revolved around the dual nationality case and Arsalan Iftikhar's case.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 04, 2012	Reactive	Unbalanced	A day in Shahbaz Sharif's camp office	<p>Discussion around protests in the assembly, the issue of electricity and the activities in the camp office.</p> <p>Participants:</p> <p>Mian Muhammad Shahbaz Sharif Chief Minister Punjab</p> <p>Raja Riaz Ahmad PPP</p> <p>Shaukat Mehmood Basra PPP</p> <p>Farooq Ghurki PPP</p>

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 05, 2012	Reactive	Balance	Dual nationality	Parliamentarians holding dual nationality and new conspiracies brewing in Islamabad. Participants: Khawaja Muhammad Asif PML-N Senator Moula Bakhsh Chandio PPP Aasma Jahangir President Supreme Court Bar Association

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 06, 2012	Reactive	Balance	Arsalan Iftikhar's case	The chief justice creates precedence by launching investigation into allegations over his son. Participants: Kashmala Tariq PML-HK Muhammad Malick Analyst Babar Sattar Lawyer

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 07, 2012	Reactive	Balance	Arsalan Iftikhar's case and the chief justice quitting the bench hearing the case.	Details on why the chief justice quits the bench hearing his son's case. Participants: Senator S. M. Zafar PML-Q Khawaja Saad Rafique PML-N Nadeem Afzal Gondal Chan PPP

8. Aaj Kamran Khan Kay Sath

Aaj Kamran Khan Kay Sath is a show based on analysis of the everyday political development. Due to the proximity of events, dual nationality issue, Arsalan Iftikhar's case and various other developments were discussed during the show.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 04, 2012	Reactive	Unabalance	Dual nationality, load shedding; Imran Khan and PTI, Prime Minister's visit to Quetta and Karachi target killings	PTI's disowning of the load shedding issue will politically cost them. Rehman Malik neither remains UK national, nor a parliamentarian nor a senator. Chandio PPP Aasma Jahangir President Supreme Court Bar Association

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 05, 2012	Reactive	Unabalanc	Arsalan Iftikhar's case, suicide by a person from Multan, Rehman Malik case and corruption scandal of Benazir Bhutto Park	Chief justice should take immediate action on Arsalan's case. The person from Multan only got justice after committing suicide. Benazir Park and the alleged corruption.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 06, 2012	Reactive	Unabalanc	Chief Justice and Arsalan Iftikhar's case, Kohistan Incident and PM Gillani's punishment	Supreme court and Arsalan Iftikhar's case, five girls killed in Kohistan and the case over the Prime Minister.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 07, 2012	Reactive	Unabalanc	Arsalan Iftikhar's case and NICL scam	Supreme court issues orders for Amin Fahim's arrest and attack on a religious seminary in Quetta.

9. Apas Ki Baat

Apas Ki Baat is a show hosted by MuneebFarooq in which NajamSethi, a senior journalist/editor; gives his analysis on politics and prevalent circumstances in the country. Dual nationality case, ArsalanIftikhar's case and Baluchistan were the dominant issues during the monitoring period.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 04, 2012	Reactive	Balanced	Dual nationality issue, threats to Aasma Jahangir, Baluchistan and FC	Dismissal of Rehman Malik, Parliamentarians with dual nationalities and Baluchistan situation.

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 05, 2012	Reactive	Balanced	Arsalan Iftikhar's case, United States' apology over Salala incident and Prime Minister in	Application submitted to the Chief Justice, asking him to look into the case of his son. What's in the budget for the people? When would USA apologize to Pakistan? What's in the budget for the people? When would USA apologize to Pakistan?

Monitoring Date	Tone	Analysis	Topic	Content
June 06, 2012	Reactive	Balanced	Arsalan Iftikhar case	Article 04 for judges, search for proof; replies by Najam Sethi on allegations over him.


Individualland

Creating space for the individual

Individualland creates choices! As an innovative research-based consultancy and advocacy group we open up space for the individual. Our focus is the role of the media and to generate a peaceful discourse in society. We are working to increase the number of responsible journalists, media-literacy among citizens and a greater acceptance for different ways to live.

www.individualland.com/FIRM info@individualland.com

Find us on facebook:

 Individualland

 CAT IL